

Whither the Roots?

Photographing the Erased Home

(IMAGES 1 & 2)

'At last I have something I can point to, and tell my children 'that's where mummy grew up'.' These words belong to Jan McTaggart and appear at the end of my photo-book *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place*.¹ She is looking at a series of digital montages consisting of a family 'snap' and a contemporary landscape photograph. The location is Foxbar, Paisley in the west of Scotland, where tenement housing was knocked down in the 1990s, to be replaced by private housing, renamed streets and the original community dispersed. When she agreed to take me to Foxbar in 2007, and look for evidence in a location that was once home, Jan herself had not been back for fifteen years. Later she writes 'how could I know myself when the place where I was formed doesn't exist anymore? No houses, no schools, no streets.'²

There is already a lot going on between these opening remarks and the two photographs. Firstly, a mother's desire to show evidence of *what-was-once-home* to her children; secondly, two kinds of photographies (the family snap and a landscape) with the play between past and present; lastly, the practicalities of photographing an erased home, and the different motivations for both photographer and collaborator.

A repertoire of photographs now flood the mind, from the spectacle of controlled demolition of tower-blocks no longer fit for purpose to other homes destroyed through

¹ Jan McTaggart in Nicky Bird, *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place* (Edinburgh: Stills, 2010), p. 44.

² Jan McTaggart in Nicky Bird, *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place*, p. 44.

conflict. Regardless of whether such images enter the public domain through the efforts of an artist, amateur, or photojournalist, we are frequently in the territory of aftermath and traces, as critics such as David Company remind us.³ Therefore a range of photographs presses to widen the conversation, to connect the local to the global. After all, the 'whither' in *whither the roots* has other meanings beyond 'wither' or 'where'. This leads to a question: whither are we wandering? and an inherent danger of wandering without definite purpose or destination. However as its Scottish meaning is to stroke, beat, we will stay rooted in Scotland, where some wandering in its central belt will be necessary. This is not simply because a particular photographic project involved close collaboration with individuals and communities across Scotland, whose physical surroundings had gone through major economic change or housing regeneration.⁴ It is in order to make the connections between *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place* with the wider ramifications of ideas of home, community, and citizenship.

This means leaving Foxbar temporarily, and travelling east to Glasgow and Edinburgh, where two recent events were pertinent reminders of the wealth of photography's portrayal of its citizens living in its most iconic and infamous places. Media coverage of the demolition of the first of Glasgow's Red Road Flats, and the breadth of the Red Road Cultural and Legacy Project showed their significance: an

³ David Company, 'Safety in Numbness: Some Remarks on Late Photography', in David Green (ed.), *Where is the Photograph?* (Brighton & Kent: Photoforum & Photoworks, 2003), pp.123-132. Company begins with a discussion of Joel Meyerowitz's photographs *After September 11: Images from Ground Zero*, but he widens this to address the trend he sees in contemporary photography.

⁴ In addition to Foxbar, the project worked in Prestongrange / Morrison's Haven, East Lothian; Doon Valley, East Ayrshire; Ardler, Dundee; and Craigmillar, Edinburgh.

ambitious post-war housing project for 5,000 people, residents ranging from the indigenous, working-class Glaswegians to asylum seekers from many parts of the world.⁵ One of Glasgow's most well known photographers, Oscar Marzaroli, documented the construction of Red Road Flats but it is a cropped detail from his famous photograph 'The Castlemilk Lads, 1963,' that takes us to Edinburgh. Now in the form of a poster, the face of one lad – with a multi-storey under construction in the background - was part of a publicity campaign to celebrate the re-opening of the Scottish National Portrait Gallery.⁶ The teenager looks poignantly away to something outside of the photographic frame. The word 'proud' is printed across the poster. The original photograph was also on show in a dedicated space to photography but visitors would have first been greeted by an ironic introduction, in the form of Michael Reisch's huge landscape photograph of Glen Coe in the Highlands of Scotland.⁷ As the opening image for the first exhibition of a new photography gallery within a national portrait gallery, this striking curatorial statement declared landscape *is* identity. But all is not what it seems. The photographer has digitally depopulated Glen Coe, erasing all contemporary signs of life. This eerily resonates to a history,

⁵ Catrin Nye, 'The end of Glasgow's Red Road Housing Estate', *BBC Newsnight*, 11 June 2012 <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-scotland-glasgow-west-18366783> [accessed 4 January 2013]. For examples of reminiscence work, film and in particular the scope of Streetlevel's photography projects, see Red Road Flats, <http://www.redroadflats.org.uk/> [accessed 4 January 2013].

⁶ The Scottish National Portrait Gallery re-opened in December 2011, following a major multi-million pound renovation, to critical acclaim.

⁷ Michael Reisch, *Landscape*, 7/004, 2007, in the exhibition 'Romantic Camera: Scottish Photography and the Modern World,' 1st December 2011 – 3rd June 2012.

pre-photography, of the highland clearances, a very real - if distant - stripping of citizenship.⁸

Photography, land and citizenship: these terms bring two voices. Ariella Azoulay alerts us to the fact 'that citizenship is not a stable status that one simply struggles to achieve but an area of conflict and negotiation.'⁹ Liz Wells reminds us, 'Imagery feeds our desire for a clear sense of identity and of cultural belonging; critical imagery may question that previously accepted.'¹⁰ Although Azoulay writes largely on photojournalistic imagery from the Israeli-Palestinian context, while Wells attends to predominantly landscape photography from selected areas of the UK, US & Baltic states, both authors intensify the act of looking at photographs. Wells points out that it is the viewer's *responsibility* to look, although Azoulay pushes this more as nothing less than the spectator's 'civic duty' 'to watch' a photograph.¹¹ Both discuss the importance of photographic strategy, often drawing from their deep knowledge of a

⁸ From email correspondence with Duncan Forbes, Senior Curator of Photography, Scottish National Portrait Gallery, following his talk in front of the Reisch photograph, 29 February 2012. Despite the rhetorical tone here, as 'citizenship' cannot apply in the modern sense, this is not to under-estimate the displacement of people from their homes in the Scottish Highlands. For an online introduction to this history, see Education Scotland: The Clearances, <http://www.educationscotland.gov.uk/scotlandshistory/jacobitesenlightenmentclearances/clearances/index.asp> [accessed 7 January 2013]

⁹ Ariella Azoulay, *The Civil Contract of Photography*, (New York: Zone Books, 2008), p. 31.

¹⁰ Liz Wells, *Land Matters: Landscape Photography, Culture and Identity*, (London: I.B Tauris, 2011), p. 5.

¹¹ Wells, *Land Matters*, p. 4; Azoulay, *The Civil Contract of Photography*, p. 14.

specific photographer or artist's methodology. This means close attention is given to practical processes from which the final photograph emerges. In Azoulay's case, where the photographer is unidentified, she extends this to textual reconstruction of a photographic situation. Therefore Azoulay and Wells make explicit connections between methodology and critical readings of photographs, which shape dramatically what questions of citizenship are provoked in a triangle of forces made up of a viewer, a photographer and the photographed subject.¹²

Let's demonstrate this with Marzaroli's photograph of the Castlemilk lads, its public display, and a press story that leads to the voices of photographed subjects – the Castlemilk lads now in their 60s. Although story, image and accompanying caption can easily be found online, it is worth beginning with a brief description of the photograph, in which a group of lads crowd around the photographer. One stares straight into the lens, his chin on the shoulder of another teenager, who is perhaps caught in mid speech. His clasped hands heighten the poignancy of his look to something out of the photographic frame.¹³ In *Shades of Grey: Glasgow 1956-1987*,

¹² For specific examples, see Azoulay on Michal Heiman's 'Photo Rape' series based on photographs of demolished Palestinian houses, in *The Civil Contract of Photography*, pp. 343-44; see Wells on Ingrid Pollard's work with the theme of the Black figure in the English landscape, in *Land Matters*, p. 205, and pp. 276-279.

¹³ Oscar Marzaroli, Online Collection, National Galleries of Scotland: http://www.nationalgalleries.org/collection/artists-a-z/M/4064/artist_name/Oscar_Marzaroli/record_id/22171 [accessed 7 January 2013]. The caption states: 'The 'Castlemilk Lads' is one of Marzaroli's best-known photographs. Shot on one of the growing housing estates on the outskirts of Glasgow during the 1950s, it speaks of a city altered by town planners beyond all recognition. The provocative stare of three of

the photographer's full caption is simply 'Red Road Flats/Children/Demolition: The Castlemilk Lads, 1963.'¹⁴ The gallery caption is more expansive, describing the lad's look as 'angst'. It also points the finger at the unseen town planners and the politics of place. The boy who stared straight into the lens sees this interpretation in 2012, and counters "Unfriendly environment?" he says. 'That's absolute rubbish. I was quite annoyed when I saw that. Flaming cheek.'¹⁵ The photographed subject, still living, speaks back to the interpretation of a photograph. What effect does this have on the viewer who takes responsibility for watching not just this photograph but for a chain of associated images, prompted by the (now demolished) multi-storey in the background?¹⁶ A contest between first-hand experience and other knowledge

the boys and the angst of the one looking away, give us a clear idea about the unfriendly environment which they inhabit.'

¹⁴ Oscar Marzaroli, *Shades of Grey: Glasgow 1956-1987* (Glasgow: Third Eye Centre, 1987), p. 98.

¹⁵ Peter Ross, 'Whatever happened to the Castlemilk lads?', *Scotland on Sunday*, 24 June 2012, <http://www.scotsman.com/scotland-on-sunday/scotland/whatever-happened-to-the-castlemilk-lads-1-2373401> [accessed 7 January 2013]. For a reproduction of the story as it appeared in the *Scotland on Sunday Spectrum Magazine* with a photographic restaging of the Castlemilk lads as adults, see 'Marzaroli's Castlemilk lads, Document Scotland, <http://www.documentscotland.com/tag/oscar-marzaroli/> [accessed 7 January 2013].

¹⁶ For an example of a play with femininity and perhaps a rehearsal of motherhood-to-come in tenement streets see, Marzaroli's photograph 'Girls and Dog, Gorbals, 1963,' *Shades of Grey*, p. 71; Also see Joseph McKenzie's *Gorbals Children: A Study in Photographs* (Glasgow: Richard Drew Publishing, 1990), p. 101; and Ray McKenzie, 'Boys and Girls Come out to play,' Rhona Warwick (ed.) *Arcade: Artists and Place-Making* (London: Black Dog Publishing, 2006), pp. 128-137. His essay

discourses emerges (fuelled by reality and rhetoric about failed housing schemes, and the impact on communities). This evidences Ray McKenzie's point about the '...more general problems that arise when we try to use photographs to situate ourselves within the historical continuum of a particular place.'¹⁷

(IMAGES 3 & 4)

Architectural discourses have implicitly joined in here, so for more explicit help we should turn to another eyewitness. In his article, provocatively titled *Self Image and Self Harm: The Gorbals and Glasgow*, Johnny Rodger gives his account of the Queen Elizabeth Square tower block demolition, in 1993:

'... the crowd stood silent and grim. There was a rather collective holding of breath, and a frog in the throat. My personal feeling is that what suddenly struck home was the immensity of waste in this act of destruction, that on one moment a whole history, a concrete embodiment of years of people's lives, their endeavours, their hopes, their failures, their joy, their sadness, even their deaths could be wilfully annihilated.... Somewhere we felt as we walked away

discusses another Marzaroli photograph featuring three boys playing in high heels and the public sculptural figures made by Liz Peden based on the photograph. McKenzie also discusses Joseph McKenzie's *Gorbals Children* and observes how the photographer 'took the trouble to revisit the area 20 years later to show how quickly the low-rise housing blocks that had replaced the tenements had degenerated into the same semi-derelict condition.' p. 131.

¹⁷ McKenzie, *Arcade: Artists and Place-Making*, p. 132.

in a gloomy silence that our hearts had just been exiled from something – what was it? Were we all refugees from ‘new beginnings’?’¹⁸

Rodger spells out the investments in a building of 120 homes in the moment of watching its destruction. The implications of a community being exiled from home, the notion of *watching* injury and a sense of displacement leads back to Azoulay’s urgent voice. She argues how the photograph allows for a reading of injury, and how this:

‘...becomes a civic skill, not an aesthetic appreciation. This skill is activated the moment one grasps that citizenship is not merely status, a good, and piece of private property possessed by the citizen, but rather a tool for struggle or an obligation to others to struggle against the injuries inflicted on those others...’¹⁹

Azoulay contends that it is the look of the photographed subject that raises the question of what also happens to the spectator’s citizenship. For her, photography in particular has ‘privileged access’ to impaired citizenship, and the ways in which women are particularly vulnerable. She spells out the definitions of citizenship and non-citizenship, in the context of conflict, catastrophe, and disaster. This raises the stakes for a practice involving photographing the erased home, and even highlights a

¹⁸ Johnny Rodger, ‘Self Image and Self Harm: The Gorbals and Glasgow,’ *The Drouth*, (June 2006), pp. 41-45. For more recent association of city planning with self-harm, see Malcolm Fraser’s response to the demolition of red brick Victorian tenements for the Commonwealth Games in Dalmarnock, in *Urban Realm*, 11 April 2011, http://www.urbanrealm.com/news/2837/Malcolm_Fraser_speaks_out_over_Commonwealth_Games_demolitions.html [accessed 7 January 2013]

¹⁹ Azoulay, *The Civil Contract of Photography*, p.14.

horrible, explicit hierarchy given the desperate situation on which Azoulay writes.²⁰ Closer to (my) home in the UK, Liz Wells reminds us of the worth of photographic strategies, which draw attention to 'hidden hierarchies of British citizenship' that we may find within the British Landscape.²¹ Wells' discussion of the impact of multiculturalism suggests the call to a range of photographic approaches in order to read the landscape for the more oblique ways in which hierarchies of citizenship may currently lie within in it. So before returning to Jan on location in Foxbar, first a detour to an industrial archaeological site eight miles outside Edinburgh.

(IMAGES 5 & 6)

On the east coast of Scotland, Prestongrange and Morrison's Haven had been the focus of a community archaeology project for five years.²² These two photographs are of the area where miners' houses once were: home to around 44 families. In 1961 the local colliery closed, the houses demolished. In 2007 their bricks were uncovered, brushed, recorded, measured, drawn, and of course, photographed before being – to use an archaeological term - backfilled. 'It breaks my heart,' says Nancie Burns who grew up on this site. Her turn-of-phrase, using the present tense, evokes Azoulay's notion of injury in a very live sense, even within a landscape

²⁰ Azoulay, *The Civil Contract of Photography*, pp. 31-84. In Chapter 1, she provides definitions of citizenship and non-citizenship, which includes the category of impaired citizenship, and the differing implications for Israeli women, and Palestinians.

²¹ Wells, on Ingrid Pollard, *Land Matters*, p. 205.

²² The project had two phases: 2004-2005, and then 2007-2010. A full account can be found in *Digging into the Past: 800 years of Prestongrange* (booklet), (Scotland: East Lothian Council, 2010).

photograph without people as 'the photograph is the site where the collaboration coughs up its secret.'²³

Alongside Nancie Burn's oral testimony were her own family photographs, including one group photograph of 25 children. One of these children included John Yeoman, and in my photo-book, I describe how, when the archaeologists were looking for a glass flue, he turned up with his family photograph taken on the same site, then a 'drying green' in the early 1930s.²⁴ The photograph featured himself as a boy, hand on hip, stood alongside his younger brother and showed how family life and industrial working life were knitted together. A stone wall behind the boys, marked the colliery where the men worked and where the children were told not to play. Also behind the boys, were several full washing lines: the drying green was the site of women's work. On occasions, when the wind went in the wrong direction, the washing got covered with coal dust.²⁵

The above photographs and narratives are told within the context of an archaeology project, which, as another volunteer so succinctly put it, was both a community of

²³ Azoulay, *The Civil Contract of Photography*, p. 411. Jean McGeough, the first resident of the Red Road Flats, also talks about her heart 'breaking', see Catrin Nye, *BBC Newsnight*, 11 June 2012, <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-scotland-glasgow-west-18366783> [accessed 4 January 2013].

²⁴ Bird, *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place*, pp. 4-5.

²⁵ The combination of mining, and brickworks means mostly men were employed at Prestongrange, but there is photographic evidence that women were employed in its saltworks.

geography and interests.²⁶ This is the situation for telling of stories of a 'lost' community, traditional in the sense that it was locally bounded with heavy industry literally on its doorstep. Some attention to a wider 'discourse of community' should be given before finally travelling back to Foxbar.²⁷ Sociologists, Anthropologists, Ethnographers, and others pointing to political and ideological uses, would elaborate more thoroughly on why 'community' is such a contested term, but as Gerard Delanty explains '...if anything unites these very diverse conceptions of community it is the idea that community concerns belonging.'²⁸ This should be considered alongside the Social Anthropologist Anthony Cohen's concluding remarks to his book *The Symbolic Construction of Community*:

'Our argument has been, then, that whether or not its structural boundaries remain intact, the reality of community lies in its members perception of the vitality of its culture. People construct community symbolically, making it a resource and repository of meaning, and a referent to their identity.'²⁹

²⁶ Graham Robinson, interview in 'Reflections on the Project', DVD, *Digging into the Past: 800 years of Prestongrange*.

²⁷ I am grateful to the expertise of two people here: Dr Jo Vergunst, Department of Anthropology, University of Aberdeen, and Dr Philomena de Lima, Director of Centre for Remote and Rural Studies, University of the Highlands Islands.

²⁸ Gerard Delanty *Community*, (London: Routledge, 2003), p. 4. Interestingly, he later remarks that for political communities, 'It [community] is almost invariably another word for citizenship that stresses less the entitled citizen than the dutiful citizen.' p. 90.

²⁹ Anthony Cohen, *Symbolic Construction of Community*, (London: Routledge, 1985) p.115.

Belonging, vitality of culture and identity: the significance of how photography, personal living history and physical erasure come together is now becoming clear.

(IMAGES 7 & 8)

When I recount my experience as a volunteer on the archaeology project to Jan in 2007, her response is immediate: 'This has happened to me'. Some account can be found in *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place* on the realisation that a 1930s working class landscape spoke to another, younger more urban generation, and the demolition of one form of social housing seemed to connect to another.³⁰ Among the family snaps she showed me was one of Jan as a girl outside her home in the late 1970s and another photograph she took in the same spot before her home was demolished in 1992.

Not long after our meeting, Jan sent me an email, with a Google Earth™ image of Foxbar. She had used Google Earth to map the past on the present, so the old street names appeared alongside with the new. Jan had also superimposed some grey rectangles to work out, from memory, where tenement blocks used to be, now in relation to private semi-detached housing. She could only get so far with Google Earth so I went to the National Map Library of Scotland and got copies of maps. With much more detailed information from a 1974 map of the area, Jan plotted in buildings, backyards, paths directly onto the copy of a 2004 map. The flat, green area indicated in the contemporary map was not so empty after all. We were ready to go to Foxbar.

³⁰ Bird, *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place*, p. 6.

On arrival, we found there was still evidence of mid 20th Century tenement life: remnants of steps, a twisted handrail and some pathways. The initial experience was one of disorientation. For Jan, it was because she was trying to draw from her memory as a little girl to locate things that were no longer there.³¹ For me, it is because I couldn't know what I was taking a photograph of. Certain elements I had control over; setting up the tripod, making light readings for the maximum depth of field, focus and so on: but for the content, I was relying on her direction. Clearly, an insider's intuition and knowledge were crucial when all the obvious reference points appeared to have gone. A hunch Jan had, to where a washing line post once was, gave her a mandate to knock on someone's door and ask permission to go into their garden to take a photograph. She explained to the resident that she grew up here, and showed them a family photograph of her mother and neighbour sitting in a grassed backyard. Permission was granted.

This leads to another kind of layering of past and present in which only one of us can say 'yes it was there,' so the photograph was taken regardless of the fact that the camera points in direction of the sun. Away from the location, on a laptop, a scanned version of the family snap was dropped into the landscape image, with Jan determining its placement. Later she wrote on the back of a work print, her memory of long, hot summer days, how her mum often sat outside chatting with her neighbour, got annoyed about mowing the grass when neighbours didn't take their turn. Jan also wrote how her mum would like the garden as it is now, although she would probably concrete the lawn. For Jan, the digital montages were tangible evidence, and 'a palpable record of places that once existed and that the memories were real.'³² For me, it became a photographic method that worked with other

³¹ Bird, *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place*, p. 6.

³² Bird, *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place*, p. 44.

collaborators, resulting in a body of work that could speak to an audience not connected personally to the materials, who may have no knowledge of the place, and no direct experience of such examples of communal living.

As the title of this contribution has suggested, the notion of returning to a lost home brings with it nostalgia, and ambivalence about 'belonging'. This might be apparent having taken the reader through the photographic process, in which collaborators have taken me to the spot their family photograph was originally taken. What of its connection to citizenship? Wells observes,

'It is possible to inhabit – 'be' in – one place, yet take another as a key sense of identity, thereby inducing a rupture within the notion of 'be-longing'. Given the historical tensions over British Citizenship, not just in legal terms, but also social status, ambiguities over cultural identity are hardly surprising...'³³

Azouley argues: 'I assume that photography – taking photos, being photographed, and disseminating and looking at photos – provides a privileged access to the problem of impaired citizenship, as well as a moral practice in the face of the vulnerability this condition creates.'³⁴

Does this suggest then, given the personal archaeology within the process I described, that such sites as Foxbar hold traces of impaired citizenship? The photographed subject's retort of 'Flaming Cheek' might come back to haunt me, so let's be clear that I am not intending to imply collaborators, such as Jan are living now as impaired citizens. We have to be careful about what assumptions are made about 'impaired citizenship' at a time when the photographed subject's life has

³³ Wells, *Land Matters*, p. 204.

³⁴ Azoulay, *The Civil Contract of Photography*, pp. 37-38.

moved on.³⁵ But the 'ruptures' to the collaborators of *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place* have been real, and have left their mark in the landscapes of Scotland. At the end of the project, I remarked that 'The kinds of housing now demolished, and industries that have disappeared, have been largely associated with British working class communities, to which photography has a particularly fraught history.'³⁶ I would now revise this 'to which *not only* photography has a particularly fraught history.' Through reflecting on a photography project and moving through the central belt of Scotland, we have caught other voices, photographs, histories & discourses along the way. Some have been implicit such as housing policy, and regeneration. This, in other ways, connects to Azouley's point about differential systems of citizenship, as people I have met, who have lived in social housing, or housing tied to industry, seemed more critically aware of the ways they were 'governed.'³⁷

Whilst acknowledging that this contentious territory is beyond the scope of a photography project, the digital montages of *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place* - first and foremost - evidence a particular relationship and dialogue in which collaborators gave me permission to make aesthetic photographs of derelict, abandoned, or regenerated sites. Azoulay and Wells, in different ways, consider both the issues and the values of an art photographer's aesthetic judgment. Power

³⁵ See Azoulay's discussion of Dorothea Lange's 'Migrant Mother' and the complaints of Florence Owens Thomson, the photographed woman, in *The Civil Contract of Photography*, p. 101, 107, 125, 129.

³⁶ Bird, *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place*, p. 10.

³⁷ Azouley, *The Civil Contract of Photography*, points out that 'citizens are, first and foremost, governed. The nation- state creates a bond of identification between citizens and the state through a variety of ideological mechanisms, causing this fact to be forgotten.' p. 17.

relations are inescapable. The photographed 'trace' of a named individual's home, community and personal history, does however set 'conditions that raise inseparable questions about the family snap, social identity and loss.'³⁸ So in these circumstances perhaps the implications for the 'conditions' of citizenship are that moment of impairment, rupture that - while demonstrated through an individual - suggests the importance of speaking to a wider community beyond the original 'clearly bounded' one. A photograph has its limits. It doesn't capture all the detail of personal stories, although it does evoke memories and solicit speculation. It does connect specific individuals to an audience that is prepared to 'watch' a photograph as 'a repository of meaning' and to listen out for the legacies of (in this case) working class cultures. These are intertwined with gender, social and architectural histories. What of the politics?

For Wells, the practice of landscape photography is connected to the politics of place and patriarchy, where women - historically speaking - have 'occupied a satellite position' while contemporary women photographers have turned the theme of land to explore, among other things, 'alternative histories.'³⁹

For Azouley, the photography and politics of place is to 'anchor spectatorship in civic duty towards photographed persons who haven't stopped "being there"...'⁴⁰ Azouley's visceral analysis is made in a context where land, politics, and struggle are connected to particular, on-going brutal realities.

³⁸ Bird, *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place*, p. 10.

³⁹ Wells, *Land Matters*, p. 188.

⁴⁰ Azouley, *The Civil Contract of Photography*, p. 16-17.

Land, contest, identity, belonging and hierarchies of citizenship: these all lie in 'whither the roots' whether we photograph or watch photographs of the erased home. We can watch these for the British working class culture, that hasn't stopped being there. We might listen to the it-breaks-my-heart or the pragmatic good-riddance-to-bad-rubbish. Some of us might be told don't-forget-your-roots. Finally Jan's closing words summons the importance of bringing such photographs to a wider community for: 'I am not alone in losing and rediscovering my history.'⁴¹

Bibliography

- Azoulay, Ariella, *The Civil Contract of Photography* (New York: Zone Books, 2008).
- Bird, Nicky, *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place* (Edinburgh: Stills, 2010).
- Campany, David, 'Safety in Numbness: Some Remarks on Late Photography', in David Green (ed.), *Where is the Photograph?* (Brighton & Kent: Photoforum & Photoworks, 2003), pp.123-132.
- Cohen, Anthony, *Symbolic Construction of Community*, (London: Routledge, 1985).
- Delanty, Gerard, *Community*, (London: Routledge, 2003).
- Digging into the Past: 800 years of Prestongrange* (booklet with DVD) (Scotland: East Lothian Council, 2010).
- Marzaroli, Oscar, *Shades of Grey: Glasgow 1956-1987* (Glasgow: Third Eye Centre, 1987).
- McTaggart, Jan, in Nicky Bird, *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place* (Edinburgh: Stills, 2010), p. 44.
- Nye, Catrin, 'The end of Glasgow's Red Road Housing Estate', *BBC Newsnight*, 11 June 2012 <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-scotland-glasgow-west-18366783>
[accessed 4 January 2013]

⁴¹ Bird, *Beneath the Surface / Hidden Place*, p. 44.

Red Road Flats, <http://www.redroadflats.org.uk/> [accessed 4 January 2013]

Rodger, Johnny, 'Self Image and Self Harm: Glasgow and the Gorbals', *The Drouth*, June 2006

Ross, Peter, 'Whatever happened to the Castlemilk Lads?', *Scotland on Sunday*, 24 June 2012, <http://www.scotsman.com/scotland-on-sunday/scotland/whatever-happened-to-the-castlemilk-lads-1-2373401> [accessed 7 January 2013].

McKenzie, Joseph, *Gorbals Children: A Study in Photographs* (Glasgow: Richard Drew Publishing, 1990).

McKenzie, Ray, 'Boys and Girls Come out to play,' Rhona Warwick (ed.) *Arcade: Artists and Place-Making* (London: Black Dog Publishing, 2006), pp. 128-137.

Marzaroli, Oscar, *Shades of Grey: Glasgow 1956-1987* (Glasgow: Third Eye Centre, 1987)

Rodger, Johnny, 'Self Image and Self Harm: The Gorbals and Glasgow,' *The Drouth*, (June 2006), pp. 41-45.

Wells, Liz, *Land Matters: Landscape Photography, Culture and Identity*, (London: I.B Tauris, 2011).

Websites

'Marzaroli's Castlemilk lads', Document Scotland, <http://www.documentscotland.com/tag/oscar-marzaroli/> [accessed 7 January 2013].

'The Clearances', Education Scotland, <http://www.educationscotland.gov.uk/scotlandshistory/jacobitesenlightenmentclearances/clearances/index.asp> [accessed 7 January 2013]

'Malcolm Fraser speaks out over Commonwealth Games demolitions', Urban Realm, http://www.urbanrealm.com/news/2837/Malcolm_Fraser_speaks_out_over_Commonwealth_Games_demolitions.html [accessed 7 January 2013]

Oscar Marzaroli, Online Collection, National Galleries of Scotland,

http://www.nationalgalleries.org/collection/artists-a-z/M/4064/artist_name/Oscar

[Marzaroli/record_id/22171](#) [accessed 7 January 2013].

Artworks

Michael Reisch, *Landscape*, 7/004, 2007, in the exhibition 'Romantic Camera: Scottish Photography and the Modern World,' Scottish National Portrait Gallery, Edinburgh 1st December 2011 – 3rd June 2012.

Other

Email, Duncan Forbes, March 2012

Photo by Everett/Shutterstock. This landscape photographer felt most at home in the rugged terrain of the Sierra Nevada, and his images proved instrumental in conserving the wilderness of the American West. Although he often worked eighteen-hour days, Adams devoted much of his energy to the protection of national parks, including his beloved Yosemite, where heâ€™d first tested an old Kodak Brownie at the age of fourteen. Today, the photographs he left behind serve as a powerful reminder of the importance of preserving this heritage. The Tetons and Snake River, Grand Teton National Park, Wyoming. About 1941. He died in 1987 and his wife, Amina, died in 1999. Friends remember Ibrahim as a hardworking man. He used to return home late and chat with us, smoking a cigarette, said Kanchi Abdul Rahman Thakur, alias Appa Chachu, one of Ibrahim's oldest friends. Dawood could not look his father in the eye after he got into crime. Parents cannot be blamed for the actions of their [grown-up] children. Kanchi Abdul Rahman Thakur, Ibrahim's friend. Thakur, now in his late 70s, has seen Mumbai's underbelly in the 1980s; he interacted with dons Karim Lala and Haji Mastan in their heyday. He said Ibrahim Photographing the erased home. The notion of returning to a lost home brings with it nostalgia, and ambivalence about "belonging". The kinds of housing that have been demolished, and disappeared industries, are largely associated with British working class communities, to which photography has a fraught history. My essay asks what are the "conditions" of citizenship, and what are the limits of a photographic practice in this context? I make my arguments as a visual practitioner. With text and six key colour plates, the implications of a photo-ethnographic, community-based research project on the photographer. China sought to bury news of the protests. Jeff Widener's images conveyed the bloody reality. The student. Along with a massive domestic censorship effort to erase the collective memory of the violence, the Chinese Communist Party has also mounted a far less well-known campaign of interference: influencing how the anniversary is portrayed in media overseas. I experienced this campaign firsthand. When I was writing my book on the legacy of Tiananmen while working as a foreign correspondent in Beijing, I had to participate in an unavoidable journalistic shell game, writing stories to give me cover to interview sources who were under surveillance. I took elaborate precautions to protect the project.